

---

## NEW CAMPBELTOWN GRAMMAR SCHOOL – SITE SELECTION

---

### 1. SUMMARY

- 1.1 This report sets out the proposed approach and methodology for identifying the preferred site for the location of the new Campbeltown Grammar School. It identifies a long list of sites and the criteria for shortlisting and identifying the preferred site(s) to be taken forward for Council approval and public consultation. The report also sets out a proposed process for engaging with the public in respect of the preferred site(s).

### 2. RECOMMENDATION

- 2.1 It is recommended the Council agree that:

2.1.1 – The option appraisal methodology set out in paragraphs 3.2 to 3.6 of this report, and the attached Appendix 1, should be applied, by Council staff, to determine which of the long listed sites, identified in Appendix 1, should be taken forward for public consultation as the preferred sites;

2.1.2 – The Council should undertake a public consultation, in respect of the preferred sites identified in 2.1.1, in accordance with the methodology set out in paragraphs 3.7 to 3.14 of this report; the detailed arrangements for the consultation to be delegated to the Executive Director of Community Services in consultation with the Lead Councillor for Education and Lifelong Learning; and

2.1.3 – The processes identified above should be undertaken in accordance with the timescale set out in Appendix 2 of this report.

### 3. BACKGROUND

- 3.1 At the meeting on 28 June 2012, the Council agreed that officers should, in respect of the new Campbeltown Grammar School:

- *Develop the option appraisal process that will produce the preferred site or sites;*
- *Develop a consultation process, in liaison with Campbeltown Grammar School, in respect of the preferred site, or sites; and*
- *Report to the Council on the proposed process in respect of the above.*

## Proposed Site Appraisal Methodology

- 3.2 As part of this process the Council is looking at possible sites in and around Campbeltown for the proposed construction of the School. The intention is to pursue a site options appraisal process that will identify the optimum site having regard to a number of factors which include: Educational benefit; Community access; Affordability relating to the potential costs associated with each site and; Deliverability taking into account the complexity of delivering the project on any given site.
- 3.3 The site option process has been constructed with the intention of identifying preferred sites which provide the optimum position for the Council having regard to these factors.
- 3.4 The detail of the option appraisal process is set out in Appendix 1 attached and would encompass two phases. These are broadly described as:
1. Long listing – This is the process of identifying the long list of potential sites that may be considered for the location of the new school. The design team has consulted a number of stakeholders. These stakeholders included Local Members, the Council's Legal and Estates Services and Education colleagues. In addition, feedback was received during a Masterplanning event chaired by Sam Cassels of Architecture and Design Scotland. This event was attended by representatives from ACHA, Strathclyde Fire and Rescue, Argyll and the Isles Enterprise, Argyll College, CHORD, and private sector businesses, in addition to staff from roads, planning, and education. The long listing process identified a list of 11 potential sites as set out in 2.2 of Appendix 1.
  2. Appraisal – It is intended that this process would be divided into two parts:
    - a) Short listing – This would involve applying simple 'pass/fail' criteria to the sites to determine whether any sites are simply unfeasible for construction (see para 2.4 of Appendix 1)
    - b) Detailed Appraisal - the short list of options would be evaluated against criteria which should reflect the broad objectives of the project itself. The proposed approach is set out in para 2.7 of the attached Appendix 1.
- 3.5 It is intended that the Project Team would undertake the above option appraisal in a workshop format with contributions from the relevant Council stakeholders including Education, Finance, Legal, Planning, Community and

Culture, Leisure and Transport. The results of this process would be to identify the preferred sites that could be taken forward for public consultation.

- 3.6 Following the public consultation the options appraisal process identifying the preferred site for the new school would be expected to be completed and the results reported to the Council on 24 January 2013 as set out in the proposed timescale in Appendix 2 of this report.

#### Proposed Public Consultation Methodology

- 3.7 It is expected that the Council will wish to seek as broad and deep a view on any preferred sites as possible. Campbeltown Grammar School management have expressed a clear wish for the school to lead the process of public consultation with assistance from other Council staff. In this way the School would be, and be seen to be, the owners of and drivers of the process.
- 3.8 The principal objectives in consulting on the preferred sites would be to:
1. Provide contextual information in relation to the sites and the considerations the Council has had in identifying these as preferred sites;
  2. Obtain the view of the public, against the contextual information provided, regarding which site is considered the most appropriate.

#### *Contextual Information*

- 3.9 To achieve the objectives above, the Council would intend to provide contextual information in relation to the long list of options, how this was reduced to the preferred sites, the considerations in relation to each in respect of such matters as educational benefit, community access together with the likely affordability and deliverability position.
- 3.10 The Council would require to ensure that the public are aware that the outcome of the consultation would be a determining factor but not **the** determining factor in its consideration of which site would be chosen. The clear message would be a positive one that the Council is proposing to provide a new Campbeltown Grammar. The choice of the site is one where the Council wants to obtain the optimal site that will bring the most benefit to Campbeltown, having regard to a range of determining factors. While the Council requires to balance considerations such as cost and affordability it wishes the public to contribute their view to help inform the Council's thinking. This would allow the public to form a reasoned opinion in relation to the preference for any site.

#### *Proposed Process*

- 3.11 Information required to support the consultation:

Identification of initial long list of potential sites, including location maps to be utilised from the site selection process.

Description and explanation of site options appraisal undertaken to move from long list to short list of sites based on:

- Educational Benefit
- Deliverability of each site – size, ground and other specific site conditions including any data/commentary from SEPA, HSE, Scottish Water
- Accessibility,
- Affordability.

Information to be provided on each site for the public to understand the process used to arrive at short list of sites.

### 3.12 Short listed sites:

Public asked for their views based on the information above for the optimum site. The public view would, as with the other factors listed, be one of the factors taken into account when considering the optimum site.

#### *Public Consultation Period*

### 3.13 A number of factors will determine the timing of the consultation period.

- Overall project timescale
- Approval gained to consult (Council)
- Time to produce information required for displays, website creation, response forms
- Availability of facilities for open events
- School October week holiday. Consultation should not fall during the holiday period and/or not to start or end within the holiday period. The October holiday for CGS and associated primary schools is from Friday 5 – Monday 15 October 2012 inclusive.
- Time to collate and analyse responses
- Date to report back to Project Board, and Council.

Key features:

### 3.14 Campbeltown Grammar School to host initial meeting. An evening event is proposed.

This meeting to focus on:

- The good news story for Campbeltown
- Background to funding, timescale of new school development
- Site selection process
- Consultation process

- 3.15 This meeting would provide also the first opportunity for the public to view the detailed site information as listed above. Thereafter, during a 4 week consultation period, the same site information is available in the following ways:
- School and Council websites
  - In addition, Public viewing of the site information would be available over two and a half open days hosted by the school (Champions Group) but not held within the school in order to avoid disruption to school activities. The detailed site information would be available for viewing within a convenient Town Centre location such as the Burnett building, Town Hall, or Aqualibrium. The Open days are proposed as a Thursday all day from 10am – 8pm, Friday 10am – 4pm and Saturday morning 10am -12 noon. The use of a current empty shop premises to be investigated as a permanent window display during the consultation period, and beyond.
  - At the same time continued publication of the consultation process would take place through websites, school newsletters (secondary and primary), text reminders, local press and radio, displays in CGS, primary schools and the Community Centre, Aqualibrium, and Burnett building.
  - During the suggested 4 week period opportunity will also be taken to meet with focus groups to discuss the site selection. The focus groups would encompass the participants in the previous masterplanning exercise as set out in paragraph 3.4 above.

### *Consultation Responses*

- 3.16 Consultation responses to be made through links on school/council websites, using some form of electronic survey tool such as Survey Monkey, a dedicated e-mail to Campbeltown Grammar, hard copies received by post to Campbeltown Grammar or handed into local schools (primary and secondary).
- 3.17 It is proposed that the consultation process may be assisted by an independent third party, such as Architecture and Design Scotland, who could assist in mediating focus groups and the open days.
- 3.18 It is considered that the consultation process could run for a period of three to four weeks, in accordance with the dates set out in Appendix 2, and with the results of the consultation process being collated and reported as soon as possible thereafter. A proposed timescale for the entire process is set out in Appendix 2 to this report.
- 3.19 At the end of the consultation period the School, assisted by the Project Team, would collate the results of the consultation responses in relation to the

preferred options. This would then be reported in the first instance to the Project Management Board and then to the Council in the context of the considerations in relation to impact, affordability, deliverability and risk. This would allow the Council to determine which would be the preferred site for the new school.

#### *Relationship to other projects*

- 3.20 It was previously reported to members that the Scottish Futures Trust (SFT), on behalf of the Scottish Government, had expressed a preference for the new Campbeltown Grammar School to be delivered in conjunction with the improved Dunoon, Kirn and St Muns Primaries in Dunoon as a single project. The possibilities for the future improvement of the Dunoon schools are currently being reviewed, as reported to the Council on 28 June 2012, and this process is anticipated to be completed and reported to the Council by the end of the year.
- 3.21 It is intended that the conclusions of the site selection and subsequent public consultation process for the new Campbeltown Grammar School site will be reported to the Council around the same time as the completion of the review of the Dunoon schools.

#### **4. CONCLUSION**

- 4.1 The Council made a decision on 28 June 2012 that officers should develop a methodology for the identification of preferred sites for the new Campbeltown Grammar School and for public consultation on these sites. The Council also requested that this methodology be submitted to them for approval. The proposed processes set out above, and in the attached Appendices, will provide a robust, transparent methodology for arriving at a site that can provide clear educational and other benefits, is likely to be affordable and where the local community has had an opportunity to contribute to the process.

#### **5. IMPLICATIONS**

- |     |             |  |
|-----|-------------|--|
| 5.1 | Policy:     | Agreement of this report would be in line with the Council's requirements as set out in the decision of the meeting on 28 June 2012. |
| 5.2 | Financial:  | It is anticipated these measures can be implemented within existing departmental budgets.  |
| 5.3 | Legal:      | None   |
| 5.4 | HR:         | None   |
| 5.5 | Equalities: | None   |

- 5.6 Risk: If the Council do not have a clear and transparent process for site selection and consultation it is less likely that effective engagement will happen.
- 5.7 Customer Service: Implementation of these measures will enable the community engagement in the selection of the site of the new Campbelltown Grammar School.

Douglas Hendry  
Executive Director of Customer Services

Cleland Sneddon  
Executive Director of Community Services

20 September 2012

DRAFT

## APPENDIX 1

### ***Option Appraisal Brief Campbeltown Grammar Development Site Selection***

#### 1. Introduction

1.1 As part of the development of the new Campbeltown Grammar School the selection of the site will be of considerable importance in delivering the project objectives. The practice followed in other Council reviews has been to undertake an appraisal of the various options available in order to determine the optimum 'preferred' option.

1.2 The option appraisal process would be carried out in two phases, firstly to identify a list of potential sites for the construction of the new school and, secondly, to assess each of the potential sites against agreed criteria.

#### 2. Appraisal Process

##### ***Stage 1 Long listing***

2.1 The design team has consulted with stakeholders including Local Members, Legal, Estates, and Education colleagues. In addition feedback was received during a Masterplanning event chaired by Sam Cassels of Architecture and Design Scotland. This event was attended by representatives from ACHA, Strathclyde Fire and Rescue, Argyll and the Isle Enterprise, Argyll College, CHORD, and private sector Businesses, in addition to staff from roads, planning, and education.

2.2 As a result of these discussions the following eleven potential locations were identified for further, detailed consideration:

1. Existing Campbeltown Grammar School site and associated playing fields
2. Dalintober Primary School and land adjacent
3. Site of current superstore and adjacent car park
- 3a. Combined site of superstore / car park and Kinloch Park
4. The Meadows playing fields
- 4a. Combined site of Meadows playing fields and ground adjacent to Campbeltown Hospital
5. Kinloch Park
6. Recreation ground adjacent to Campbeltown Hospital
7. St Kieran's and Castlehill Primary Schools (including nursery and Community Centre)
8. Witchburn Road Council Offices
9. The Roadings

2.3 This list was then issued to internal Council stakeholders for initial comment and consideration prior to commencement of the formal appraisal process. The comments received will be incorporated into the overall appraisal report.



## **Stage 2a - Shortlisting**

2.4 Before undertaking a detailed appraisal of the options a sifting process will be undertaken to determine the sites where it is considered that it would be impossible or unfeasible to construct the new Grammar school within the existing scope of the project.

2.5 The criteria below will be assessed by the design team on a site by site basis:

- Is there any site specific factor that would make it impossible or unfeasible for development?
- Is the site of a sufficient size to accommodate the required facilities?
- Would existing, operational Council buildings, which are currently located on the site, require to be replaced elsewhere if the Grammar school is located at the site?

2.6 By applying the above provisions a short list of sites will be identified and these will be taken to detailed appraisal as described below.

## **Stage 2b - Detailed Option Appraisal**

2.7 In order to generate the preferred options the short list of options requires to be assessed or evaluated against criteria which should reflect the broad objectives of the project itself. The criteria selected may also not be of equal importance to the Council in its determination. As such, suggested 'weightings' have been assigned to the criteria in order to reflect their relative importance to the Council.

2.8 The proposed assessment criteria are:

- **Impact** – The capacity of the site to maximise the potential educational and community benefit of the development. This would be considered the most significant criterion for determining the appropriate site for construction. Factors to consider may include:
  1. **Educational Benefit** – This will be a narrative consideration by the Education Service of the potential for the site to contribute to Educational aims and objectives and would consider:
    - a. Flexibility / size of the usable space on the site
    - b. proximity to other local educational resources (eg. Libraries, sports facilities, Further Education),
    - c. scope for accommodating changing educational needs in future (eg. Inclusion of primary school)
    - d. Safer routes to school
  2. **Community Access** –
    - a. Accessibility of site to the community,
    - b. Distance from population centres.
  3. **Planning Policy** – This would determine how consistent the site is with current planning / development policy in the area.
- **Affordability** – This would assess the scale of the potential costs associated with each site beyond those of the basic construction. Factors to consider may include:

1. Land remediation – particularly dealing with possible contamination;
  2. Land acquisition costs
  3. Demolition of existing buildings;
  4. Flood risk alleviation;
  5. Utility diversions;
  6. School transport costs; and
  7. Potential reduction in costs from proximity to existing facilities
- **Deliverability** – This takes account of the complexity of delivering the project on a given site and the likelihood that the building project can be successfully implemented in a timely manner on the site. Considerations may include:
    1. Ground contamination;
    2. Flood risk;
    3. Utilities;
    4. Planning considerations;
    5. Health and safety considerations (eg. Gas safety zone);
    6. Site ownership and other legal considerations;
    7. Public acceptance – to be assessed through a focus group with general community comment in writing / email; and
    8. Roads / transport / safer routes to school implications.
  - **Risk** – An assessment of the factors that might affect risk to deliverability of the project and also to impact and affordability. Assessment to be undertaken when Impact, Affordability and Deliverability have been reviewed.

2.9 A suggested scoring system, outlined below, would score the options out of 20 for each criterion with a score of 20 being the highest. The agreed weighting, shown below, would then be applied to arrive at the final score for the option.

<b>Option X</b>				
Criteria	Max Score	Score	Weighting	Weighted Score
Impact: 1. Education Benefit 2. Community Access 3. Planning Policy  Impact Total	9 6 5  20		45%	
Affordability: 1. Land Remediation 2. Site acquisition costs 3. Demolition of existing buildings 4. Flood risk alleviation 5. Utility diversion / connection 6. School transport costs 7. Savings from proximity to existing facilities  Affordability Total	4 3 4 4 2 2 1  20		25%	
Deliverability: 1. Ground contamination 2. Flood Risk 3. Utilities 4. Planning considerations	3 2 2 3		15%	

<b>Option X</b>				
Criteria	Max Score	Score	Weighting	Weighted Score
5. HSE Considerations	2			
6. Site ownership	3			
7. Roads / Transport considerations	2			
8. Public acceptance	3			
Deliverability Total	20			
Risk:				
1. Impact	7		15%	
2. Affordability	7			
3. Deliverability	6			
Risk Total	20			
Total	80		100%	

2.10 It is intended that the Project Team would undertake the above option appraisal in a workshop format with contributions from the relevant Council stakeholders including Education, Finance, Legal, Planning, Community and Culture, Leisure and Transport.

2.11 It is expected that this option appraisal process will produce the short list of sites that will form the basis on which the public will be asked to submit their views on which site is the optimum site for the new school.

## APPENDIX 2

### Proposed Timescale

<b>Action</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Timescale</b>
Agreement by Council		20 September 2012
Shortlisting Workshop	Education / Facility Services / SPT	Last week September 2012
Public Consultation – web based questionnaire & newspaper advertising	Education / Facility Services / SPT	16 October 2012 (to avoid October break) to 16 November 2012
Open Days x 2.5	Education / Facility Services	During above period
Focus group meetings	Education / Facility Services	During above period
Collation of consultation results	Education / Facility Services	November 2012
Report to Council with recommended preferred site	Education / Facility Services / SPT	24 January 2013